


JPS

The Journal
of the
Polynesian Society



VOLUME 124 No.1 MARCH 2015

THE POLYNESIAN SOCIETY
THE UNIVERSITY OF AUCKLAND
NEW ZEALAND

REVIEWS

Kawharu, Merata (ed.), *Maranga Mai! Te Reo and Marae in Crisis?* Auckland: University of Auckland Press, 2014. 258 pp., Bib., index, photos., tables NZ\$45.00 (soft cover).

KATHARINA RUCKSTUHL
University of Otago

In late 2014, the Treaty of Waitangi Tribunal found that Ngāpuhi, and by extension other Māori tribes, did not cede sovereignty to the British as a consequence of the signing of the Treaty of Waitangi. The Tribunal's report, which is the first phase of Ngāpuhi's wider Treaty settlement claim, is consistent with Māori, legal and scholarly arguments over many years. One of the results of this political disenfranchisement has been a crisis of identity for Ngāpuhi as individuals and collectives. This is the subject of *Maranga Mai! Te Reo and Marae in Crisis?*, edited by Merata Kawharu.

The opening chapter establishes the basic premise of the book: the conflict between traditional ways of doing and being and the realities of disenfranchisement. Ngāpuhi elder Merimeri Penfold recalls the influence of the Rātana Movement in the early 20th century which, while providing cohesion to a people Rātana described as "remnants" (p. 25), also required them to turn "away from the ways of the past", the result of which left people "in a state of bewilderment" (p. 26). The following chapters outline the 21st century state of Māori language and *marae* in Ngāpuhi's region of Te Tai Tokerau, using personal observation in both Māori and English language from elders and youth, as well as analysis from a survey of 500 Te Tai Tokerau youth, the 'Te Wehi Nui a Maomao' Project.

An underlying tenet of the book is that a strong Māori identity mitigates a "state of bewilderment". In Chapter 3, Arapera Ngaha finds that those who attend *Kura Kaupapa* (schools where Māori is the language of instruction), and who are in close contact with their *marae* are, unsurprisingly, more likely to have strong cultural identity. However, as most Ngāpuhi have become disengaged from cultural practices on *marae* (Chapter 10) and *Kura Kaupapa* attendance is declining (Chapter 6), the problem becomes one of how to reintegrate communities, state institutions and families so that individuals do not continue to be cultural "remnants".

It is not all bad news. Margie Hohepa's analysis shows that schools where English is the primary language of instruction can help students' knowledge about Māori language and tribal identity, although not to the same degree as Māori language schools. Merata Kawharu and Paratene Tane conclude that for many schools in the Tai Tokerau, *marae* are important to the learning process, with both *marae* and schools benefitting from reciprocal arrangements. While some *kaumatua* (elders) criticise schools for "institutionalising" Māori language and knowledge, others acknowledge that schools are playing an important role in supporting Māori cultural identity.

The tension between the old and the new ways extends to debates within *marae* communities themselves. *Kaumātua* Fraser Toi's chapter shows how *marae tikanga* (protocol) has changed due to demographic and cultural pressures. For example, to encourage greater *marae* use, injunctions against mothers nursing babies inside *whareniui* (meeting houses) have been overturned "in contravention of *tūturū tikanga*" (established protocol). As pointed out in Stephen McTaggart's analysis of Māori language census data in Chapter 9, it is women who are more likely to "kōrero Māori than males" (p. 165).

While the book does not directly deal with Ngāpuhi's Treaty of Waitangi claim, Paul Tapsell in his chapter on the historical and contemporary development of *marae*, notes how the Treaty process of preferring negotiation with bigger entities over the smaller traditional groupings, has been another factor in marginalising *marae* and their communities.

The book offers solutions to the crisis of declining use of Māori language and *marae*. One way is to strengthen the economic basis of *marae* communities, as explained by Kevin Robinson of Te Rarawa in Chapter 5, through taking advantage of initiatives such as the growing *mānuka* honey export trade. Robinson stresses the importance of the internet, both to help individuals run their businesses from home and to link Te Rarawa *marae* to disconnected families. That the authors likewise advocate for the use of the internet to extend and strengthen cultural access is unsurprising, given that many of them had developed 'Te Wehenui.com', an online repository of Te Tai Tokerau language and culture as outlined in Chapter 12.

The strength of this book is in the space it gives to both academic and community voices. While the language and school data analysis should prove useful for planners, and the issues of moving culture onto an online platform are worth noting, for this reader the problems of maintaining an authentic identity within a *marae* context while responding to the reality of cultural, social and demographic change, was particularly insightful. While the book does not overtly attempt to theorise its findings and observations against its political background, readers will readily find plenty of examples of the "politics of indigeneity". One quibble is that while there are a number of excellent photographs of Te Tokerau *marae*, these are not named. For readers unfamiliar with these *marae*, it would have been helpful to have a list included somewhere.

Overall, the book serves its purpose of taking the cultural identity pulse of Te Tokerau *iwi* as they work towards settlement of their Treaty claim. While the Waitangi Tribunal's 2014 report vindicates Ngāpuhi's claim that it did not give up sovereignty, the issue for the future will be how to reinvigorate a cultural identity that has been impacted by the inability to make decisions as a sovereign people. In this way, this case-study resonates with the experience of other *iwi* and with many Indigenous peoples globally, which is one aim of the book. As Tapsell notes (p. 80), the challenge for Ngāpuhi will be to ensure that "decisions made today especially about Treaty settlement, language and *marae* programmes' will have the right sort of 'ripple effects on the living of tomorrow."

Schachter, Judith: *The Legacies of a Hawaiian Generation: From Territorial Subject to American Citizen*. New York: Berghahn Books, 2013. 226 pp., bib., index. US\$95.00 (hardback).

ANDREA LOW
University of Auckland

For Schachter, relationships form the ligaments, to use her word, of the *mo'olelo* (tale or history) of John Simeona and his sister Eleanor Ahuna. They are members of a generation referred to in the book title that were born in the late 1920s and 1930s and who, Schachter argues, experienced a particular process of Americanisation. Schachter claims their story is not a history of American colonialism, of which she is clearly critical, but neither is it a story of Native Hawaiian culture under United States rule. By presenting the story of Simeona and Ahuna, Schachter explores what it means to be Native Hawaiian and a citizen of the United States and investigates the relationships and entanglements between a generation who strongly identified with Native Hawaiian culture and an imperial United States that made strenuous efforts to deny their indigeneity.

Schachter has constructed an unconventional biography, but the template she draws on is Simeona's own life-writing, a *mo'olelo* which he gifted her as a 64-page book: *Life Story of a Native Hawaiian*. To write her book, Schachter also uses interviews, kitchen table chat, and hundreds of letters that Simeona wrote to Schachter over the two decades of their association. Schachter acknowledges Jonathan Osorio's contention that *mo'olelo* constitutes a form of assertive scholarship so that the *mo'olelo* is not dominated by "scholarly paraphernalia" (p. 13), but Schachter does provide notes on many referenced texts, archival and secondary sources. Referring to Denning (2004), she employs the concept of beach crossings throughout the volume. This porous, shifting metaphor and the digressive, anecdotal and sometimes contradictory *mo'olelo* underpin her depiction of the ways in which power relations influence the lives of individuals who "strenuously and steadfastly redesign that impact every day of their lives" (p. 11).

The construction of Simeona's and Ahuna's stories attends to the particulars of the individuals in time and place. Arranged in chronological order, the chapters follow them from their earliest years to their later lives as *hānau mua* (oldest living member of a family, source of wisdom). Central to each of their *mo'olelo* is their abiding connection to Hawaiian homesteads, in particular Keaukaha, near Hilo on the island of Hawai'i but there are also connections with Pana'ewa on Moloka'i and Waimānalo on Oahu. Schachter argues that the homesteads, epitomised by Keaukaha, represent a powerful critique of American policy in Hawai'i and have been sites for the unanticipated revitalisation of *ahupua'a* (a land division) customs where residents maintained "a collective way of life at the margins of the colonialist-capitalist economy" (p. 30).

Prince Kūhiō's proposal for the 1921 Hawaiian Homes Commission Act (HHCA) is one of many historical threads that run through the life narratives of Simeona and Ahuna. Following their lives as school-age children with curricula devoid of Hawaiian

history, Schachter personalises the impacts of the labour demands of the most powerful business interests and the plantation elite on young Native Hawaiian lives and the ramifications for generations to come. Schachter's deployment of this strategy brings events like the Great Depression, the Massie case and the Japanese attack on Pearl Harbour into sharp focus. Colonial pedagogy and impositions such as Standard English and scripted roles for Native Hawaiian students are also depicted through the experiences of Simeona in particular. Sixty years later in 1998 his granddaughter Ana's eighth-grade history book reveals the persistence of white-washed stories of Hawai'i's "discovery." A family funeral, inheritance and instances of *hānai* (to foster or adopt) are each revealing of the, at times, fragility of *aloha* and the conflicting values of different generations, but also the resilience and aptitude of Native Hawaiians in the face of sustained and unequal power relations.

However, there are moments when Schachter creates a curiously non-committal impression. The subtitle for example: "From Territorial Subject to American Citizen" suggests a progression of status that is a highly contestable notion, regardless of Schachter's conviction that resistance strategies are unlikely to provide a singular pathway to cultural autonomy for *kanaka maoli* (Native Hawaiians). The fluidity with which Simeona and Ahuna negotiated their identities was cultivated through necessity. Her description of Simeona learning to "practice the right culture at the right time" (p. 3) was borne out of a hegemonic disparity. Yes they have multiple subject positions, but Ahuna's determined silence about her school years is profound, and her younger sister Priscilla's statement that: "the library wasn't meant for us" (p. 62) speaks of a great betrayal of the young lives of Simeona's and Ahuna's generation. The notion that they are American citizens with all of the accompanying rights and privileges as Schachter suggests is undermined by a host of other examples: blood quantum definition of Native Hawaiian, Native Hawaiian incarceration statistics and public versus private schooling. Schachter integrates many of these issues in her text but neglects to decode or problematise American citizenship and its connection to a statehood that is not universally recognised. Schachter's positive assessment of one judge's comment that he "let them exploit the system" (p. 145), unlike his fellow justices (in relation to *hānai*), constructs Family Court rulings as subject to personal disposition. The injustices within this example are manifold but unexplored.

Schachter consistently foregrounds the lives of Simeona and Ahuna and emphasises the negotiations each of them makes, in Ahuna's case as a commissioner within the Department of Hawaiian Home Lands (DHHL) and also as an activist in her role as president of the homestead association; Hui Ho'omanu. Schachter provides detailed and contextualised examples of the ways in which Simeona and Ahuna, among others, employ constitutional processes, federal programs and legal procedures to maintain kinship practices and relationship with the land. Her depiction of these negotiations is one in which Americanisation has not overpowered indigenous Hawaiian culture.

The potential readership for Schachter's book is wide. Her portrayal of homestead life beginning with the legacy of Prince Kūhīo and the subsequent entanglements through which she describes Simeona's and Ahuna's unfolding lives actualise many aspects of Hawaiian history and epistemology and firmly locate the personal in the political. Within an academic context it is an exceptional resource in terms of life writing, a perspective on the world through the story of a life. Schachter declares early

on that she is not an insider, although she does spend time calibrating her “Auntie” status, she does not refer to any of the people she talks story with as her informants or participants, and rises to Auntie Eleanor’s challenge that she assert her point of view without making herself the central subject of the story. A lesson Schachter derives from Simeona’s writing is that *mo’olelo* is pedagogical; it is not only the account of a single individual, but transmits knowledge and learning to future generations. Schachter’s text is a meaningful addition to the canon of Hawaiian studies particularly because of her analysis of the evolution of the HHCA, but especially because of the Native Hawaiian subject-centred portrayal at the heart of the text. Whether the book fulfils Simeona’s expectations of a biography or Ahuna’s maxim that a person writes in order to create change, Schachter has reciprocated with something of value for the *’ohana* with whom she has spent so many years talking story.

Reference

Dening, Greg, 2004. *Beach Crossings: Voyages Across Times, Cultures, and Self*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Smith, Vanessa: *Intimate Strangers: Friendship, Exchange and Pacific Encounters*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010. 323 pp., bib., illustrations, index. AU\$44.95 (soft cover).

MICHAEL REILLY
University of Otago

At the heart of Vanessa Smith’s fascinating book is a Tahitian word, *taio*, signifying an “Oceanic friendship pact formalized with some degree of ceremony” (p. 69), with persons from outside someone’s own kin group, and involving an ongoing sequence of exchanges, including personal names as well as goods and services. It quickly came to be used by European explorers to describe their cross-cultural relationships with the men and women they perceived to have authority over the local people in Tahiti and other islands. *Taio* is arguably the first Tahitian word that Europeans pick up in their writings. Nonetheless, it is also a tantalisingly unknowable word which disappears from use during the 19th century. Contemporary Maohi, ‘Indigenous Tahitians’, who Smith spoke to, have no recollection of it. It only exists in the archival records of the Europeans visitors who experienced it. However, Smith’s book is not an ethnographic reconstruction of ancient Tahitian forms and practices of friendship, although these are alluded to. Instead, Smith utilises the concept of *taio* in order to explore how Europeans responded to particular demonstrations of Oceanic cross-cultural friendships, and what light these experiences throw on European ideas of friendship. The Pacific Islanders who became *taio* to Europeans are viewed through the writings of these friends and other European observers.

In the first half of this book, Smith creates a sequence of chapters that mark moments in the early European exploration of Oceania, in particular of Tahiti and other eastern islands. The first chapter looks at the welcoming crowds, highlighting their significance in the “fraught problematic of cross-cultural encounter” in Oceania (p. 35).

Such meetings between visitors and locals led to the making of *taio* relationships, but these situations might also explode in violence, as Smith demonstrates when Cook died at the hands of an assertive Hawaiian crowd. Chapter 2 examines the nature of the *taio* friendship. Europeans recognised that for Tahitians these relationships were long-lasting and emotionally significant. Much puzzled and shocked Europeans about this concept, notably that by exchanging names and thereby identity, they might become a substitute husband for their *taio*'s chiefly wife. Making friends enabled Europeans to establish a sustainable system of trade, although they reacted cynically whenever their *taio* expressed any interest in receiving commodities. Chapter 3 investigates European ideas about the nature of friendship. By the 18th century they thought of it as an affective or sentimental relationship that transcended any materialistic expectations. But in an impressive review, Smith discerns much evidence for the cool calculation of what benefits came the way of being someone's friend. The two-sidedness of European ideas of friendship were also revealed in the visitors' contradictory responses to their *taios*' open expectation of gift exchanges. Chapter 4 looks into the sceptical reactions of Europeans to displays of grief by Tahitian men and women during mourning ceremonies. The visitors thought these emotions insincere, excessive and contrived; more theatre than how a person should behave in real life. They preferred the restrained expressions by Tahitian men which better reflected their own inclination towards self command in situations of intense emotions.

In the second half of the book Smith focuses on individual stories and particular relationships between Oceanian and European explorers. Chapter 5 narrates the experiences of four Oceanians who journeyed back to Europe: Ahutoru, Tupaia (who died at Batavia), Mai and Lebuu. They and their European companions became, in the eyes of those who met them, "fellow travellers" whose "knowledge and authority became inevitably conjoined" (p. 182). Instead of focusing solely on them as part players in a larger and long-term project of imperialism, Smith argues for the possibility of viewing these travellers through the frame of friendship's "fortuitous, fine-grained hierarchies and equalities" (p. 197). Chapter 6 re-examines the *Bounty* mutiny as an event prompted by the *taio* friendships formed by various crew members. In the moment of mutiny and in its aftermath at trial, judgements as to who supported Bligh or the mutineers also came down to "the slippery signs of friendly intentions" (p. 251), including such gestures as tears (or the lack of them). Ironically, those mutineers who got away to Pitcairn ultimately transformed their accompanying *taio* into servants ("towtow"), no longer equal partners. In doing so, their actions resemble those of later colonial settlements which reduced many Oceanians to a subordinate status in their own lands; a process that may explain, as Smith suggests, why the concept of *taio* disappears from use about that time. The final chapter looks at several friendship exchanges in the Marquesas Islands. The beachcomber, Edward Robarts, successfully established a series of exchanges whereas his near contemporary, the missionary William Crook, reluctantly recognised the implicit reciprocal expectations in such relationships, preferring one-way conversions to Christianity, without success. A Catholic mission also failed when friars refused making friends of local leaders, in contrast to their interpreter, Maximo Rodriquez, who formed local relationships by helping out in the local community. Such gestures anticipate Bronislaw Malinowski's fieldwork methods built on "affective engagement" with the community (p. 293).

Smith has written a perceptive, authoritative and cross-culturally informed work. Its editing and presentation is excellent, with few defects: an incomplete sentence (p. 89) and an incorrect word (“then” instead of “than” at line 27, p. 81). A particular strength is the extensive quotation from the primary sources, including texts on friendship and explorer journals. By choosing friendship as her subject Smith explores the ways people from both sides of the beach came to know each other as particular individuals, even if only for a short while. Together they created something that was, as Smith argues, more reciprocal and dialectical; a relationship resembling the partial and particular one of the *taio*. Arguably, such gestures of intimacy have helped many colonised nations, with their legacies of inter-cultural oppression, to survive and perhaps even to prosper.

Smith, Vanessa and Nicholas Thomas (eds), *Mutiny and Aftermath: James Morrison's Account of the Mutiny on the Bounty and the Island of Tahiti*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2013. 344 pp., bib., illustrations, US\$45.00 (hard cover).

MICHAEL REILLY
University of Otago

James Morrison's two part journal and account form one of several early visitor narratives that provide foundational texts for understanding particular ancient Pacific Islands societies. As in Morrison's case these guests stayed long enough to become culturally competent participants in local society. They were also sympathetic observers who tried to report what they saw or experienced as accurately as they could. Also like Morrison, they were not strongly biased by past European intellectual speculations about Pacific peoples. Such writings provide a particular kind of Indigenous history, as told by outsiders with inside knowledge, that supplements the oral traditions recorded by Islander experts. The editors and their publishers are to be congratulated on producing a new and accessible version of this important work which will continue to be valued by Pacific scholars, and also by those fascinated by an eye-witness account of a famous naval mutiny.

The first half of Morrison's text forms a self-contained journal. The first chapter commences with embarkation in England and takes the reader to the moment of mutiny and the division of the ship and crew between William Bligh and the mutineers under Fletcher Christian. The second chapter recounts the unsuccessful attempt to settle on the island of Tubuai. Morrison puts on record a fairly comprehensive survey of the observable elements of the local culture; one not subsequently described by outsiders until 1827. Chapter 3 begins with the return to Tahiti, the division between those who stayed, and those who stuck with Christian, and what Morrison and the others did during their residence amongst their Tahitian friends. Chapter 4 recounts the capture and incarceration of the Tahiti-based mutineers on the *Pandora*, their subsequent wreck and return to trial in England.

Morrison's naval identity is prominent in the journal, especially in the earlier pages as he records nautical information such as winds and distances travelled. He also carefully notes Bligh's behaviour, both as captain and purser, towards the officers and

men, including what he allocated as food entitlements and instances of his abusive language. Later, in Tahiti, Morrison lovingly describes in detail his construction of a vessel from local materials which he hoped to sail to England. Alongside that, he recounts the mutineers' involvement in dynastic struggles between different chiefly families as they vied for dominance. While a fascinating narrative, he reveals certain cultural blindspots, notably when he describes any challenge to the ruling family as rebellion. Like later missionaries he could not see that this was a form of legitimate political process whereby different leaders contested for overall authority. The mutineers, operating as a military force, were key players in defeating the opponents of Pōmare II (or Tū), thereby ensuring his ultimate hegemony.

The second part of Morrison's work is an encyclopaedic account of all those aspects of the place, the people and their culture that he happened to observe or have explained to him. He produces a huge sequence of ethnographic snapshots, taken at the time he lived there, but presented to us as if providing a total explanation of the Tahitian world since its inception in the creation. Chapter 5 lists elements of the natural and cultural world of Tahiti, including its landscape, flora and fauna, as well as types of foods and material objects. The importance of sea-oriented activities was well understood by Morrison who devotes much space to the various sorts of fishing. Chapter 6 turns to the cultural domain of Tahiti, starting with the divisions of land and of political power, the nature of the Tahitian chief, the practice of war, aspects of religion, *marae* and priests, and various cultural practices that came to his attention including mourning, marriage, *tapu* and resource restrictions (*rahui*). The weakest link in Morrison's fascinating reportage is his attempt to explain religious ideas which require insight into an inner world that most outsiders find challenging to understand without years of guidance from experts. Chapter 7 continues to look at cultural elements that Morrison observed, such as buildings, canoes, gender roles in eating, foods, cooking techniques, clothing, various activities (such as sport, dance, music), illnesses, death and mourning. As the editors stress, Morrison's account and the journal should be viewed as "codependent" (p. 8) since both work together to explain important aspects of Tahitian cultural life, such as the practice of warfare or the making of formal friendships (*taio*).

In their presentation of this work the editors decided to retain as much as possible of Morrison's own writing style, complete with his spelling and punctuation. The only exception they made was to modernise any indigenous names and terms. In addition, Maia Nuku has contributed very helpful appendices listing placenames, islands, plants and important Polynesians who appear in Morrison's pages. As the editors point out, the reading audience for this text today is vastly different and more complex from the one who bought the first limited edition of this work, including as it does both indigenous and non-indigenous readers. For Morrison, facing trial for mutiny, writing up his journal and account must have brought back pleasant and poignant memories. If it saved his life, as the editors argue, then he also ensured that those Tahitians who befriended him remain a powerful presence for us today. This work is a priceless portal into the world of all these ancestors.