JPS

The Journal of the Polynesian Society

VOLUME 126 No.3 SEPTEMBER 2017

THE POLYNESIAN SOCIETY
THE UNIVERSITY OF AUCKLAND
NEW ZEALAND

Barclay, Barry: *Our Own Image: A Story of a Māori Filmmaker*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2015. 128 pp., photographs. US$20.00 (softcover).

JO SMITH
Victoria University

This 2015 reprint of Māori filmmaker and philosopher Barry Barclay's (Ngāti Apa) first book by the US-based publisher University of Minnesota Press signals the ongoing significance of Barclay's work both nationally and internationally and offers a still-timely toolkit to understanding both local and global Indigenous media production. The original *Our Own Image* (without the subtitle now present) was published in 1990 in the wake of the success of Barclay's first feature film *Ngati* (1987), a film widely described as a world first in Indigenous fiction feature film production. Shown in a number of international film festivals that to which Barclay and colleagues travelled, the book emerged from conversations with Indigenous communities in other countries as well as the lessons learnt by Barclay in his filmmaking practices leading up to *Ngati*'s release. These practices included, among others, the ground-breaking documentary series *Tangata Whenua* (with historian Michael King and Pacific Films producer John O'Shea), screened on New Zealand television in 1974, the made-for-television Tūhoe documentary *Journeys in National Parks: Te Urewera* of 1987, *Ngati* itself, and the film training course run by Barclay at the Hawke's Bay Polytechnic at Taradale.

In general, *Our Own Image* discusses the technological, institutional and, most importantly, cultural challenges facing Māori filmmakers in the 1980s and 1990s. The book subsequently formed the basis for what Barclay would later describe as Fourth Cinema, a significant and internationally influential concept referring to filmmaking shaped by Indigenous voices and ways of knowing within cultural contexts conditioned by non-Indigenous interests. Invaluable then, *Our Own Image: A Story of a Māori Filmmaker* remains extremely relevant today in light of the continuing production of Indigenous media both locally and globally. At the time of writing this review Taika Waititi's fourth feature film *Hunt for the Wilderpeople* (2016) enjoyed success at the box office while Lee Tamahori's *Mahana* (2016) signaled the return of significant Māori actor Nancy Brunning to New Zealand screens. In this same month, New Zealand television provider TV3 launched its new Māori current affairs programme *The Hui* with host Mihingarangi Forbes, a former employee of the Indigenous network Māori Television, established in 2004. More globally, the flourishing of Indigenous media can be seen in the 2008 establishment of the World Indigenous Television Broadcasters Network (WITBN), including television providers from Canada, Taiwan, Australia, Hawai'i, Scotland and the Sami people of the Arctic area of Sápmi. International arts festivals such as imagineNATIVE (now linked with NZ-based Ōtaki Māoriland Film Festival), launched in 2000, continue to showcase emerging Indigenous talent. Feature films such as the Aboriginal Australian

Samson and Delilah (2009) and Inuit-produced *Before Tomorrow* (2008) continue to assert the perspectives and experiences of those dispossessed through processes of colonisation. As such, the 2015 reprint of *Our Own Image* reminds its readers of the persisting challenges and responsibilities facing Indigenous media makers today, at the same time as it provides conceptual resources for understanding the complex conditions of production and consumption surrounding historical and contemporary Indigenous creative practices.

The book includes seven chapters with a foreword by Jeff Bear (First Nation Maliseet), president of Urban Rez Productions and fellow filmmaker who first met Barclay at the Australian Independent Documentary Conference held in Perth in 2001. The book also includes a letter from Barclay early on to the Chief Dan George Memorial Foundation in Vancouver, framing *Our Own Image* as a *koha* 'gift' to the people who looked after Wi Kuki Kaa and himself on their visit to Canada in October 1987. Such a beginning gives clear guidance to any reader that the book is designed as a conversation between Indigenous peoples (a form of "talking in" in Barclay's terms). Yet the book also includes a generosity of spirit that invites non-Indigenous readers to listen in and perhaps learn something about those who endeavour to affirm alternate ways of being, knowing and doing in the face of enduring constraints of a majority culture.

Chapter one is entitled "A Fitting Companion", a reference to the ways in which filmmakers need to ensure that the camera that is taken into communities acts with integrity and dignity to affirm the people of that place. This chapter discusses Barclay's experiments with film to make a camera "a good listener" while making *Tangata Whenua*, so that the flow of talk between participants could be supported and the *mana* 'authority, prestige' of the *kōrero* 'conversation' and community upheld. Chapter two, "The Other Eye", refers to the routine scrutiny and judgments endured by Māori when the majority culture holds the purse strings. This chapter offers reflections on funding imperatives that demand that Māori filmmakers represent "real Māori values", and Barclay relates a desire to make a "Māori kung fu film" to disrupt the pious expectations placed on Māori projects by both Māori and Pākehā alike. Barclay also invites his reader to imagine a reverse situation where non-Māori had to present their ideas to a Māori-controlled funding body to get their creative projects supported. This provocation, while briefly stated, provides insights into the depths of Barclay's thinking which offer the possibility of developing Treaty of Waitangi-based initiatives across New Zealand's wider civil society in ways that could have enduring and transformative effects, if only there was collective will to do so.

Chapter three, "Setting Out", begins by invoking the act of sailing, and then provides insights into the behind-the-screen practices that are an integral part of the Fourth Cinema conceptual framework. Dynamics that feed the creative and cultural processes of "being on location", training courses that raise the ugly face of institutional racism within Pākehā-run organisations, and the importance of *kai* 'meals, food' to a film shoot and to community are all layers of the complex encounters that go into Māori media making. This chapter reminds the reader of how Barclay, Don Selwyn, Selwyn Muru, Merata Mita and many others spent a great deal of their time offering mentoring and guidance to those interested in entering the media industry. Chapter four, "A Pen Among Strangers", reflects on the principles of domination

underpinning majority culture film scripts, influenced by both Hollywood and earlier forms of colonising cultures. This chapter raises the question of audience and who a Māori scriptwriter might labour for: is it to provide an "ethnic touch" to a film that might appeal to a broad non-Māori audience? Or is it a script for those people understood as your own? The chapter ends with the reflection on how, while access to a pen (as a mode of representation) may be a good first step for Indigenous creatives, true power is expressed when Indigenous forces shape the overall conditions of production.

The final two chapters, "Talking In" and "The Held Image", most explicitly articulate the ethics of filmmaking underpinning Barclay's practices and philosophies. In the former chapter Barclay outlines a significant concept in Indigenous media studies, the dual mode of address of "talking in" (designed in terms specific to the community being engaged with) and "talking out" (with a focus on communicating to a broader audience). Arguing that both modes are necessary, this chapter goes on to unpack the notion of a "communications *marae*" 'meeting place' where Māori ways of knowing and doing ground subsequent acts of communication while nonetheless remaining hospitable to non-Māori audiences. *Our Own Image* is itself a working demonstration of this model of communication. The final chapter, "The Held Image", raises the issue of *kaitiakitanga* 'guardianship' and offers thoughtful insights on the responsibilities of the media maker when people have gifted stories and images to them. Not only relevant to those institutions which house Indigenous sounds and images (Barclay's later book *Mana Tuturu* develops this line of enquiry), this final chapter also holds lessons for those who participate in making media, as well as those who consume and distribute such media at a time when media platforms are diversifying and the reproduction and circulation of media is ever-intensifying. Under such conditions, *Our Own Image* is a timely reprint relevant not only to Māori media makers or global Indigenous media studies, but to all who have an interest in the ethics and politics of media production and consumption.

Chang, David A.: *The World and All the Things Upon It: Native Hawaiian Geographies of Exploration*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2016. 344 pp., biblio., illus., index, notes. US$27.00 (softcover).

JAIME ULUWEHI HOPKINS
University of Hawai'i, Mānoa

It seems rather natural to see one's world through one's own eyes. This is as true for individuals as it is for entire societies and nations. But for the last two centuries, the story being told through education and popular media centres the Euro-American viewpoint at its core. It has been this perspective dominating politics, economics, history and academia. David Chang's book is a necessary intervention in that ongoing narrative. He reveals a Hawaiian-centred world, exploring how Kanaka Maoli, specifically people of Hawaiian ancestry, viewed their geography, and the constructions that emerged once they expanded that landscape to include the entire globe in the post-Contact period.

Geography is simultaneously physical and abstract. We can all see the same river, the same mountain peak, but the conceptual significance of that feature can be radically different from one person to the next. A 19th-century capitalist might have seen a river as hydroelectric power, or a transportation system, and would have proceeded to manipulate it into a form better suited to achieving those ends. A Kanaka Maoli might have seen that same river as the life force that waters his or her *lo'i* 'taro fields', thus providing for his family, which in turn motivated him to honour that river as a god-like manifestation to ensure its continual flow. The value judgments placed upon each of these abstract perspectives supported the "civilised" vs "savage" trope that has long dominated history. Chang turns that narrative around by focussing on the Kanaka Maoli concept of geography and illustrating how they used their own perspective to counteract the imposed "savage" label and instead presented as a "civilised" nation using the coloniser's own criteria. For example, while geography books and missionaries taught that the Holy Land was far away from Hawai'i, they also taught that what made it holy was that sacred acts occurred there. Kanaka Maoli skilfully used these same justifications by presenting a wealth of godly feats performed upon these islands using a knowledge base referred to as *wahi pana* 'storied sites', thus claiming many Hawaiian locales to be sacred as well. Chang's book is full of such flipped perspectives, challenging the idea that the people of Hawai'i ever saw themselves as anything less than civilised, by anyone's standards.

One of Chang's overarching themes is that education, and specifically geographical thought, was the continuation of an ancient practice, regardless of whether or not the content being taught was considered "Western" in origin. He begins with the idea that Hawaiians already knew of a wider world, had names for many distant lands and incorporated that knowledge into the earliest textbooks and lesson plans. Geography textbooks were used as a vehicle to reinforce a racially constructed hierarchy, but most of the teachers were Kanaka Maoli and utilised those books in ways that circumvented those destructive ideas. Chang analyses each of the geography textbooks used throughout the 19th century, teasing out the perspectives in each. All were copied from existing primers used in the United States and changed to suit the Hawaiian classroom, but the amount of Kanaka Maoli influence over each book decreases as the century progresses. The earliest textbook was translated with a significant amount of help from Kanaka Maoli, as is evidenced by the language used in the book. For example, situational words such as *nei* 'here/near' and *aku* 'there/away/far' which are commonly used in Hawaiian language are generously sprinkled throughout the text, constantly reinforcing a reader's view that Hawai'i is "here", the Pacific is "here", and other places are "there". This original book was also printed in Hawai'i, so the first few maps show a Pacific-centred world, progressively zooming in on the island nation. This earliest book also features ample information about "this" Pacific world. As new textbooks were produced through the 19th century, and as power structures changed within the Hawaiian educational system, this viewpoint changed, gradually ending up with the Atlantic-focussed geography that is so prevalent today.

Because geography was used to also teach racial supremacy (or rather, racial inferiority), the last half of Chang's book focusses on race relations between Kanaka Maoli and other peoples who were subjugated by this Western-constructed hierarchy. The author focusses generously on Kanaka Maoli–Native American relations on the

West Coast of North America, where many Kanaka Maoli sailors ended up settling. Because of their non-white appearance in a politically white-dominated land, they faced a level of racism that individuals remaining in Hawai‘i did not experience. Throughout most of the 19th century, missionaries in Hawai‘i were hard-pressed to train the people to see themselves as inferior, but in a place like California, where the law usually favored the white settler, Kanaka Maoli increasingly came to associate with and assimilate into Native American societies. It cannot be assumed, however, that in doing so they stopped identifying themselves as belonging to the Hawaiian nation. Chang focusses on specific individuals who spent their lives with their adopted Native American kin, but who also built a Kanaka Maoli stronghold in this distant land. A portion of a chapter also examines how sailors from various Pacific nations interacted mainly with African Americans along the East Coast of the United States. Since these interactions were more transient in nature, they undoubtedly generated children of Pacific ancestry, but did not necessarily create the same kind of communal connections that emerged between the West Coast and Hawai‘i. In the racial hierarchy presented in geography books, Kanaka Maoli were ranked slightly higher than Native Americans, and significantly higher than Africans. Yet, interactions along both coasts indicate that, despite their supposed higher ranking, Kanaka Maoli often sided with those deemed “inferior” over the course of the 19th century. It is, however, erroneous to assume that they had many opportunities to choose otherwise, nor that they would have sided with white settlers if they had the chance. Part of Chang’s analysis includes the regard Kanaka Maoli held for the Haole ‘foreigner’ (but also a term that increasingly came to identify people of white ancestry), and how that esteem decreased over the course of the century.

Chang’s work earns greater value for using Hawaiian-language sources to inform his research. Scholars of French history must speak French, yet, up until very recently, scholars of Pacific history were not required to learn the language of the island group they study. The result was that most academic works about the Pacific (Hawai‘i included) were assembled using research composed only in Western languages. This trend is changing as the wealth of the indigenous archive is finally becoming known. Chang has become another participant in this still-young practice, and let us hope that he sets an example for others.

Ian Conrich and Herman Mückler (eds): *Rapa Nui—Easter Island: Cultural and Historical Perspectives*. Berlin: Frank &Timme, 2016. 250 pp., biblio, illustrations. €37.20 (cloth).

CARL P. LIPO
The State University of New York, Binghamton

Since Europeans first encountered the island in 1722, stories about Rapa Nui (Easter Island, Chile) have been a thread woven into the cultural fabric of Western culture. In a wide variety of books, movies, art and stories, Rapa Nui is characterised as a mythical place that is simultaneously ancient, exotic and conceptually challenging. Following this thread, generations of explorers, merchants, naturalists, travellers,

tourists and researchers have been drawn to this tiny island in a remote part of southeastern Polynesia. The accounts, drawings and photographs from these visitors to the island have then continued to inspire countless legends of lost continents, ancient civilisations, secret rituals, untranslated languages and mysterious statues. Generally speaking, these tales stem from observations made on the island of Rapa Nui but are often dramatically exaggerated, reshaped and emphasised to reflect European desires and fears.

Rapa Nui—Easter Island: Cultural and Historical Perspectives, a multi-authored volume, features a wide-array of authors documenting the ways in which Rapa Nui has woven its way into European culture. The central core of this work describes how the island has inspired the myth of the lost content of "Mu" (Dominic Alessio), feeds exotica to art appearing on music albums (Dan Bendrups), forms the setting of a French cartoon series (Jennifer Wagner), has led to claims about extraterrestrial visitors (Roy Smith), and serves as a backdrop for the adventures of fictional characters from Scooby-Doo to Dr. Who (Ian Conrich). As a consequence, if one is expecting this book to contain extensive new information about Rapa Nui (i.e., the island, its archaeological record, the people who live there and so on), the content within the book is going to be at least partially disappointing. Roughly half of the book focuses on the *idea* of Rapa Nui and how this idea has played a role in European cultural phenomena. For many, the topics here will be amusing: we learn of aliens, fantastic adventurers, magic and other classic *moai* 'monolithic human figures' inspired tropes. For those who study Rapa Nui as a physical place and people, however, some of the chapters may be a bit naïve or demonstrate a shallow use of the primary academic literature. For example, Bendrup's chapter on Rapa Nui-based album cover art argues that CD covers are used as they are "durable in withstanding the island's subtropical environments" (p. 75), an assertion that begs the question as to what alternative choices island musicians would have in recording and distributing their music. Similarly, Alessio's chapter references secondary newspaper articles about archaeological findings rather than the original sources, leading to a somewhat skewed interpretation of the findings. Yet, given the theme of the volume, the overall emphasis on European imaginings of Rapa Nui and the lack of empirical evidence is certainly consistent.

The book, however, also features content that centres more directly on Rapa Nui in terms of the island's environment, people and material culture. Three archaeologically-focused contributions, offer interpretations of the use of caves in prehistory (Ruth Whitehouse), island-centric perceptions of the island's archaeological landscape (Sue Hamilton), and a consideration of the "risk" perception that must have accompanied potential failures during monument construction (Colin Richards). These chapters provide interesting and plausible takes on the archaeological record, but like the rest of the volume's chapters, are firmly embedded in extrinsic interpretation. The chapter on Rapa Nui caves, for example, reflects that these spaces have an effect on the senses and induce fear for visitors, a claim that is largely based on the personal experiences of the author in Mediterranean caves. This claim is then used to argue for their purpose in "rites of passage". It is impossible to determine, however, whether caves induced such emotions among Rapanui in the past. Such claims entirely reflect

the logic of an outside observer. For Rapanui living on an island riddled with caves, there is no necessary reason to think that they would have experienced these spaces in the same way as a present-day European. But once again, given the shared theme of the book, this is a consistent logic.

The three last chapters of the book (Rafeł Wieczorek, Albert Davletshin and Tomi Melka) explore the character and diversity of the famously undeciphered Rongorongo script. Even these chapters, however, tend to focus on an interpretative reading rather than being strongly analytic and thus reflect views and opinions of outsiders more than placing Rapa Nui phenomena in an island and historical context. For the linguistic chapters, the dependency on external logic is done out of necessity: lacking a translation, researchers here are forced to use descriptions of non-randomness as a means of extracting patterns from these cryptic characters. Whether they are successful in achieving this goal, however, is impossible to say, but the chapters prove useful in their documentation of the still-enigmatic script. Interestingly, the chapters on the Rongorongo script are the best documented of the volume and provide original data and detailed analyses.

There are two chapters that can be distinguished from the majority of the book. The first is the relatively standard historical documentation by Hermann Mückler of Walter Knoche and his visit to the island in the early 20th century. Like many Europeans before and after Knoche, he is afforded his own story and recognition of the contributions made toward European knowledge of the island. Knoche's visit was just a little under two weeks in duration and his descriptions have not contributed much to subsequent research. The point of the chapter is to recognise that Knoche's ethnohistoric descriptions, photographs and collections pre-date those of more widely-known Katherine Routledge, who arrived a few years later and after the death of a number of key elderly islanders.

The other distinctive chapter is the most intriguing of the volume. Maxi Haase's chapter on "Popular Perceptions and Local Negotiations of Easter Island Culture" provides an outsider view of some of contemporary struggles of islanders to redefine themselves through tradition, while also recognising that much of the fame of Rapa Nui comes from the myths and tales told by generations of Europeans who now contribute economically via the recent massive influx of tourists. As Haase points out, the narrative of Rapanui people depends on indigenous voices who are taking increasingly control of the administration of the island and the message that they wish to share with the world.

Overall, this volume serves to bring together a disparate group of researchers with wide-ranging topics centred on ideas about Rapa Nui. In that sense, the book is an excellent demonstration as to how this tiny island has permeated and influenced popular and academic European discourse. Based on sometimes wildly inaccurate representations, the island has served as an exotic canvas for the extraordinary and these edited chapters serve to document and explore some of these remarkable flights of fancy. Ideally, with better primary documentation and greater access to first-hand observations, the gap between the European imaginings and the historical record of Rapa Nui will close, while also leading to new, better-grounded narratives that fully embrace the details of empirical record of this remarkable island.

Tomlinson, Matt and Debra McDougall (eds): *Christian Politics in Oceania.* New York, NY: Berghahn Books, 2013. vix + 235 pp., bib., figs, index, maps. US$90.00 (hardcover).

ROGER I. LOHMANN
Trent University

Christian domination across Oceania, fractured along denominational and cultural lines, has political consequences. This fine volume explores the intersections of Christianity and politics in relatively young and weak states of the Western Pacific. The chapters mainly describe and analyse local struggles, losses and triumphs during ethnographic moments when cultural anthropologists were living in the thick of things, while touching on broader regional and temporal perspectives.

In the introduction, Tomlinson and McDougall point out that Christianity is very frequently treated as an assumed basis for agreement in the cases from Papua New Guinea, the Solomon Islands, Vanuatu and Fiji featured in this book. Churches often serve as focal points for all sorts of political concerns, they argue, because while states are often distant and ineffectual, churches are often socially present and vibrant venues for action. Politicians, governments and constituents make ubiquitous references to Christianity. However, while both churches and states have universal pretentions that may inspire common identity, cultural divisions continually give the lie to claims of national or cosmic unity. It is inaccurate to label these countries "nation-states" (e.g. p. 5) since they comprise multiple ethnic and cultural aggregates, including indigenous and exogenous religions as well as multiple versions of Christianity.

Courtney Handman's chapter, "Mediating Denominational Disputes: Land Claims and the Sound of Christian Critique in the Waria Valley, Papua New Guinea", discusses the tension between the universalistic aspirations of Christianity and on-the-ground political realities. Her examples are a land dispute between denominations and questions about the appropriateness of locally traditional drums versus introduced guitars for church services. In the first situation, a church leader claimed authority from God. Resistance exposed speaking on behalf of a deity to be neither politics-free nor universally "true", but rather an act of domination. In the latter situation, drum use signalled a critique of the competing denomination.

Michael W. Scott's chapter, set in Solomon Islands, compares competing images and evaluations of Makira Islanders' notions about an underground army. These discourses draw both on pre-contact beliefs in underground, dwarfish indigenous people who represent true, primordial custom (*kastom*), and cargoist ideas deriving from World War II and recent civil war experiences. The dominant view is that the underground army will bring back a purified customary way of life on earth that is conflated with Christian ideas of Heaven. Scott compares this to the view of a Seventh Day Adventist couple who conflate the underground army with Satanic powers.

Matt Tomlinson's chapter considers how denominational politics affect Christianity in Fiji. Although his focus is on a particular sermon reflecting a fleeting moment following a coup, he contexualises this in the broader history of Fiji since missionaries arrived in 1830. Tomlinson shows how religious fashions respond to and influence political developments in a country's history. The sermon, associated with the

breakaway New Methodist denomination, called on listeners to accept the new government since their coup's success proved divine approval. This denomination emphasises newness and chatty prayer rather than the formulaic prayer of Methodism.

Annelin Eriksen's "Christian Politics in Vanuatu: Lay Priests and New State Forms" relates recent theorising about how states work to the contemporary denominational situation in Vanuatu. Non-governmental organisations such as churches carry out state functions of organising people, distributing resources and providing services. How these developments relate to non-state political systems and non-Christian religions in this part of the world is not described.

Debra McDougall's chapter, "Evangelical Public Culture: Making Stranger-Citizens in Solomon Islands", traces knock-on effects of Billy Graham's 1959 Australian tour. It inspired people to seek personal evidence of supernatural favour and helped generate denominational diversification and acceptance of non-Christian religions including Islam. She illustrates this with the sect-hopping religious lives of two young men. Transcending the cacophony is evangelical drive and charismatic worship, which connects people from different ethnic, geographic, linguistic and religious orientations.

John Barker's "Anthropology and the Politics of Christianity in Papua New Guinea" shows that the preponderance of cultural anthropologists working there has led to an emphasis on local communities rather than state-wide perspectives. Work on the relationship between Christianity and PNG politics has addressed connections between Christianity and traditional leaders, millenarian movements, vernacular Christianity, conversion and the relationship between continuity and change.

Geoffrey White argues in "Chiefs, Church, and State in Santa Isabel, Solomon Islands" that the state has yet to be clearly conceptualised in the "government" component of the three-part Melanesian paradigm of government, church and custom. He documents 30 years of events surrounding the installation of chiefs and bishops, and fraught efforts to create a meaningful role for chiefs as both part of and distinct from the state. While imagery of "traditional" chiefship and Christian institutions are well integrated, the state appears stodgy and artificial.

Joel Robbins's chapter asks, "Why Is There No Political Theology among the Urapmin?" His answer is that roles requiring self-assertion, critique and conflict ("politics") are separated from those expressing religious and social unity in their identity as charismatic Christians. I wonder if restricting "politics" to individual wrangling as opposed to organising around common sacred assumptions might not introduce confusions. Urapmin pastors and deacons are also political leaders, but they maintain common purpose rather than expressing controversial views. As Robbins says, it is helpful to "stretch" culturally limited definitions of politics to fit the varying empirical realities that anthropologists discover.

Webb Keane's afterword points up several patterns emerging from the volume. Christianity both unifies and divides people. There is a widespread assumption that morality must or should have a basis in religion, and in Christianity in particular. And, Christianity's explicit rules exist in tension with implicit moral systems. This high-quality and original volume inspires us to ask what is distinctive about Christian politics versus that of other religions and secular ideologies. Answering this question enables us to recognise the uses and dangers of politically charged Christianities and other supernaturally based truth claims.