
REVIEWS

Bennett, R.S., *Treaty to Treaty: A History of Early New Zealand from the Treaty of Tordesillas 1494 to the Treaty of Waitangi 1840, Volume 2: 1494-1799 Western Powers Reach Out to the East and Pacific Ocean*. Auckland: RSB Publications, 2011. lvii + 301 pp., bib., index, maps.

PHYLLIS HERDA
University of Auckland

Treaty to Treaty, Volume 2 is a compendium of information and documents regarding European exploration in the Pacific as it relates to New Zealand. In it Bennett traces European activity in the area from 1494 to 1799. His stated focus is on New Zealand, but in the volume he casts his net much wider, considering events and voyages in the Pacific and Asia. The work is the second in a self-published trilogy. *Volume 1* presents background essays relevant to the overall topic of early European interest in the region, while *Volume 3* centers on voyages and their documents from 1800 to 1840.

Bennett's introductory section consists of an eclectic mix of material which includes a short and somewhat curious essay speculating about the possibility and probability of European explorers in Australia and New Zealand prior to Abel Tasman's "discovery" in 1642, six early maps of the region, a list of the rulers of England from 1485 (Henry VII) to 1901 (Queen Victoria), a calendar of European voyages to the Pacific beginning with Fernão Magalhães (Ferdinand Magellan) and ending with the voyage of the London Missionary Society ship *Duff* under the command of James Wilson, an essay on the Spanish—British rivalry in the New World, a list of politicians and office holders in Britain, Australia and Norfolk Island, and an essay on the background to the Treaty of Tordesillas. The wide-ranging nature of the introductory section is representative of the entire volume. This section would have been enhanced by an examination of the context of the debate surrounding these early voyagers and European discoveries.

The main part of the volume begins with a brief summary of papal bulls and political events leading to the Treaty of Tordesillas between Spain and Portugal. The Treaty, endorsed by the Pope, divided the New World between the two Catholic kingdoms and began Europe's fascination with what would become known as the Pacific. Bennett provides a translation of portions of the Treaty as well as an account of political intrigues and strategies which informed it. He then proceeds to chronicle all of the known voyages to New Zealand and the southern Pacific region. Major voyages, such as Magellan's crossing and naming of the Pacific, Mendaña's "discovery" of the Solomon Islands and the expeditions of James Cook, are compiled and presented alongside lesser known journeys and expeditions, such as those financed by Jean Ango in the 1530s and 1540s as well as the mysterious 1576 voyage of Juan Fernandez.

In addition, the activities of the British East India Company, the Dutch Vereenigde Oost-Indische Compagnie and other similar organisations are summarised attesting to the wider European interests in the region and how they influenced activities throughout the southern Pacific. Each entry is concise and reasonably well informed with many including bibliographic information for further reading. The presentation is somewhat quirky, in an academic sense, but the wealth of factual detail as well as the presentation in bold of key names, places, and terms makes it a quick and handy reference for voyagers to the region.

Bennett returns to the theme of the possibility of other visitors to New Zealand before Tasman in a series of appendices which consider the likelihood of Arab and Chinese explorations in the region by cataloguing the surviving wisps of Portuguese and French cartographic and documentary evidence for the improbable discoveries. It is somewhat surprising that this material is presented separately from the essay in the introductory section as both cover similar themes. All this material would be better placed in an appendix. A brief, but useful index completes the volume.

Treaty to Treaty, Volume 2 is not your usual academic history book. At times the material presented suffers from the apparent passions of the author. A more careful and considered analysis of the voyages and events presented would have enhanced the volume, as would a more judicious organisation of much of the data. However, the book does inform the reader about which Europeans were in the region, where they went, and when. It also includes some discussion of the contextual issues in Europe, which influenced how the Pacific was perceived, and its exploration deemed desirable. Overall, *Treaty to Treaty, Volume 2* is a credible calendar of voyages and events which influenced the European exploration of New Zealand and the wider southern Pacific region.

Gershon, Ilana: *No Family is an Island. Cultural Expertise Among Samoans in Diaspora*. Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press. 2012. 208 pp., bib., index. Price US\$69.90 (hardback), US\$22.95 (paper).

PENELOPE SCHOEFFEL

Centre for Samoan Studies, National University of Samoa

Ilana Gershon's ethnographic exploration of Samoan migrant experiences contrasts their situation in two countries, New Zealand and the United States, and in two contexts, in their churches and ceremonial exchanges (*fa'alavelave*), and in their interactions with the state. Her analysis of how Samoans represent themselves to the state in the US and New Zealand—and the complexities of that interface—invokes the concept of “reflexivity” to pin down analytically different constructions of “culture” by government officials and community workers, and Samoan migrants themselves. In my opinion, the concept does not add much to an otherwise richly and insightfully considered ethnography.

The book is in two parts roughly corresponding to these contexts. In the migrant imagination “Samoa emerges as a nostalgic utopic space... the site of authentic

and properly enacted cultural knowledge". From this perceived reality, Samoan migrants select, classify and construct the "cultural", the sentiments, obligations and performances they perceive as integral to their identity as Samoans, and define what Gershon terms "the a-cultural" in their encounters with state welfare offices and community organisations.

Part One examines the most salient markers of Samoan identity, kinship and church membership, and the performance and affirmation of that identity through contributions of money for family *fa'avelave* and church donations.

In my experience, first generation migrants are expected to send money to close kin in Samoa for practical needs, such as house building, small businesses and school fees, as well as medical and financial emergencies. Those adults who wish to affirm kinship ties to Samoa, whether migrants or the children and grandchildren of migrants, are expected to contribute, both in their new homeland and in Samoa, to expensive *fa'avelave*—funerals, weddings and chiefly installations—and to help fund the big 1st, 21st and 50th birthday parties that have become commonplace among Samoan migrants.

Further, monetary solicitations are made of migrant communities by visiting parties from Samoa raising money for building churches and other village development projects. On top of all these are further financial obligations to churches. Members of the majority and definitively Samoan Congregational Church are obliged to provide weekly financial contributions. These are publicly announced, encouraging families to demonstrate their pride and win prestige by exceeding one other in their giving. The Congregational Church also obliges church members to collectively pay their pastors' salary or stipend, house payments, and other sundries, such as electricity bills, car payments and personal holidays.

Gershon discusses how those requesting funds do not appear to base the size of the expected gifts upon the actual financial resources of the giver because people usually do not disclose their incomes in efforts to retain some control of them. In the context of these heavy and ambivalently borne financial burdens, she explores the spoken and unspoken motives underlying conversion from Samoan mainstream churches (Congregational, Methodist and Catholic) to newer churches (such as the Assemblies of God, Latter Day Saints, Seventh Day Adventists and Jehovah's Witnesses). These non-mainstream churches not only provide more individual and often more expressive religious experiences, but apparently are also less financially demanding. Some of these churches even frown on and discourage *fa'avelave* and most prescribe tithes, or treat donations as matters of private conscience, thus removing them from the arena of interfamily competition.

In Part Two Gershon explores the different approaches towards the funding of minority needs and recognition of "culture" by social services bureaucracies, in New Zealand and the United States, and Samoan migrant responses in representing their culture and communities. In both countries neo-liberal agendas have recognised that there are potential efficiencies to be gained by shifting responsibility for dealing with social problems from state agencies to civil society. The New Zealand approach has been shaped by the formal, and in some instances legal, recognition of the right to cultural difference and cultural rights among indigenous Maori, which has influenced

state approaches to the needs of Samoans and other Polynesian migrant minorities. Migrant groups soon recognised the opportunities provided by such policies for funding projects and getting jobs. However, there have been many problems of “cultural fit”, for example, the Children, Young Persons and Their Families Act of 1989 that enshrines policy-makers’ assumptions about “cultural” solutions to social problems. Their expectation that Samoan and other Pacific Islander migrant families would be comfortable with frank, open discussions of family problems proved to be fraught with misunderstandings of how of culturally conditioned modes of communication actually operate.

Samoan migrants in the US are a relatively insignificant minority, in contrast to their status in New Zealand. Social service provisions in California acknowledge the possibility of *ethnic* minority disadvantage, but not of *cultural* disadvantage. In New Zealand ten years ago (the time of which Gershon writes), the state accepted an obligation to help Samoans preserve their culture, an obligation that was not recognised in the more assimilationist US. There, modest funding for social services is available for secular community organisations that represent ethnic communities, but this system does not work well for Samoan communities, which are largely church-based. Gershon describes the hopes cherished by Samoan migrants in both lands that there would be specifically Samoan solutions to intergenerational social problems, if only the younger generation would properly “learn their culture”. Unlike New Zealand’s welfare bureaucracy, which is more open to such notions, US social workers promote doctrines of assimilation that specifically encourage families to become “American”. In the US system “learning to be American” is a fundable objective, although it is unlikely that American Samoans (who have lived under an American administration for the past century) need to learn this. In the American context Gershon found that it was difficult for Samoans to be accepted by their own communities as “translators” mediating between two kinds of worldview. The problem is that social service providers assume that modern psychological approaches to family welfare and associated modes of communication have cross-cultural relevance and applicability, and in one of Gershon’s many revealing examples, a government social worker attempts to explain to an uncomprehending Samoan family how children should be encouraged to “express their emotional needs”.

The book provides substantial anthropological insights for migrant studies, and would be a useful text for American and New Zealand social workers, even if the academic mode of expression may affect readability for this important audience.

Schindlbeck, M: *Gefunden und verloren: Arthur Speyer, die dreißiger Jahre und die Verluste der Sammlung Südsee des Ethnologischen Museums Berlin*. Berlin: Ethnologisches Museum, 2011. 272 pp., appendix, bib., illustrations. Price: €44.90 (paper).

TOBIAS SPERLICH
University of Regina

This book (an English title might be *Found and Lost: Arthur Speyer, the Thirties and the Losses of the South Seas Collection of the Ethnological Museum Berlin*) describes the sale and exchange of objects from the Berlin Museum's South Seas Collection into the international art market during the early 20th century. The book introduces to a wide audience the practice, so common in museums around the world during that period, of identifying particular ethnographic objects as "duplicates" and selling or trading them with other museums or professional art dealers. While providing a thorough overview of the Berlin Museum's dealings in these activities from the 1900s and into the 1940s, this book has a focus on the interactions of one particular dealer (Arthur Speyer) with the Museum's South Sea Collection during the 1930s.

The book contains six chapters. The first three chapters ("The Duplicates", "The Twenties", "The Thirties") provide a useful understanding of the contexts in which the losses to the Museum's collections could occur. These chapters introduce key players at the Museum, as well as collectors and trade networks, sketch out the various paths that objects took out of the Museum, and the reasons that led to this large-scale "sellout" (p. 16). These rationales ranged from the practical (minimising pressures on space by scaling down collections) and the pecuniary (supporting the construction or renovation of buildings, allowing for new purchases, etc.) to political motivations (colonial revanchism, an increased interest in European collections driven by Nazi ideology, etc.). What is remarkable is that there is a striking consistency in the poor quality or outright lack of documentation of these transactions throughout this period, suggesting a conscious attempt to conceal details of these activities by those involved. The fact that "numerous large-scale objects left the Museum without them having been signed out of the inventory books" (p. 70) meant that the losses suffered by the collections during the interwar period are not only many but literally immeasurable.

The fourth chapter ("The Speyer Collection") is the most substantial of the chapters in this book. It represents the cornerstone of the publication, as it is the case study around which all materials in the book revolve: the collections of Arthur Speyer (1894-1958) and his interactions with the Berlin Museum. This private collector is perhaps the most fascinating individual to trade with the Museum, as an uncountable number of objects flowed through him from the Museum to the international art market. Schindlbeck tells the story of Arthur Speyer, who started collecting ethnographic objects in 1921, in a gripping and colourful manner. Much of the information comes directly from Speyer's son who was interviewed by Schindlbeck. These first-hand accounts are augmented by archival information. Seen together, these sources create a detailed picture of the kinds of objects sold to Speyer, the circumstances of their sales, and the paths they took to other dealers and institutions after Speyer had acquired them. Schindlbeck's

portrayal of Speyer as a person whose love and appreciation of the material culture of the South Pacific (and other parts of the world) was genuine and heart-felt is rather positive but the author does not shy away from criticism. He points out repeatedly, for example, that Speyer exploited an emergency situation at the Museum and that his actions “resulted in [...] large losses in the collections” (p. 104).

Although brief, the final two chapters (“The Losses of the Berlin South Seas Collection” and “Closing”) offer some important conclusions on the issues raised throughout this volume. Perhaps most important among those is that Schindlbeck’s work strongly suggests that the tendency of museums, particularly in Germany, to label missing objects in their collections as “war losses” (p. 209) is perhaps not accurate. Indeed, as he concludes, “museums were not always custodians of their treasure” (p. 215) and the sales of significant numbers of objects in their care to dealers are all too often kept quiet. Interestingly, he argues, due to their sheer size, these sales supported, shaped and even created an international market in ethnographic art that could not have existed otherwise, a dynamic that so far has gone understudied.

The final 45 pages of the book contain a sizeable appendix of archival materials from the Museum and elsewhere, and a detailed inventory of known objects that left the Museum’s South Sea Collection until the 1940s. The book is beautifully illustrated throughout: 130 b/w plates and 20 colour plates, some specifically produced for this volume.

Unfortunately, the volume suffers from some problems with copy editing, and the numerous typographical, grammatical and factual errors and inconsistencies—combined with the sometimes choppy flow of the text—can be distracting. The volume is also primarily descriptive and lamentably does not provide much analysis or many firm conclusions. However, this book is a significant first step. By sharing his considerable inside knowledge of the history of the Berlin Museum, Schindlbeck provides a much-needed reference point to an eminent collection and lays a foundation for future research on it and collecting practices of this time more broadly. Indeed, his work should and surely will serve as a catalyst for further investigations into the interplay of museums and the ethnographic art market, both on a documentary as well as a theoretical level.

Finally, Schindlbeck’s work can also be read as a timely cautionary tale. Set against the backdrop of a time not unlike today, when public finances are strained and museums are scrambling to make ends meet, this book serves as a reminder that one of the core functions of the museum is as a guardian of the objects kept inside its walls and the histories, values and knowledge these objects embody. Schindlbeck sums this up poignantly in his last sentence to the book: “[The] transformation of a collected figure, ceramic, bark cloth painting, and so forth into an arbitrary article of exchange... is an attack on the self-respect of any curator or collector of ethnographic materials” (p. 220).

Small, C.A.: *Voyages: From Tongan Villages to American Suburbs*. 2nd Edition. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2011. 312 pp., appendix, bib., figs, index, maps, notes, tables. US\$19.95 (paper).

‘I.-FUTA-HELU ‘OFAMO‘ONI
University of Auckland

The second edition of Cathy Small’s exploration of migration and interplaying cultural shifts has extended the span of the original work to 30 years. It is an interesting and engaging meditation on contemporary globalisation told through the shared journey of the American anthropologist who became “Tonganised”, Tongan participants who became “Americanised”, and the latter’s children who occupy an ambiguous position between and within the two ethnic/national identities.

By detailing and analysing the life courses of a family as they move between one small Pacific nation and the United States, Small sought to craft a portrait of the general state of late 20th/early 21st century transnational migration. It is a world of large-scale movement from former colonies and protectorates to (neo-)colonial centres, by people who maintain strong links with family in their countries of origin, enabling extensive, protracted movement back and forth. This, Small argued, has caused profound, ongoing changes in sending nations’ demographics, economies, and cultural landscapes, while creating multiple, changed and confused identities, particularly for generations growing up in receiving nations.

Though her argument was cogent, a potential weakness was the lack of detailed engagement with literature on migration, globalisation and work from other countries or regions. In fact, there was very little in the way of theory or in-depth analysis until Part IV, and even then it did not incorporate much from other scholars. This was intentional however: Small wanted her text to be accessible to a non-specialist, educated audience, targeting the US reader in particular.

That is not to say there is little of value for the academic. Of particular note is an interesting interrogation of common American idealisations about immigration, including that the US is “a beacon of hope in a sea of desperation” and “the land of opportunity” (p. 186). Small argued that these “myths” were based on previous waves of European settlement to the US, but that the Tongan case showed contemporary migration to be of a different nature: migrants were not the desperate but those with means, and often went from relatively prestigious social positions at home to bottom-rung employment in industrialised nations. Upward social mobility, she noted, typically took place only in the home country, once US savings had been exchanged for the weaker currency.

By examining these tropes, Small demonstrated how the topic of migration requires consideration of the receiving culture just as much as the relocating one, their mutually influencing nature being a key theme of the book.

This extended to exploring the status of socio-cultural anthropology in a globalised context. Small did not identify her work as “post-modern”, though *Voyages* is nonetheless an example of what good post-modern scholarship can be. Small’s pragmatic rather than ideological reason for her approach was that participants

were also her neighbours, friends and fictive kin, as well as potential readers of the ethnography. Collaborative, reflexive, experimental anthropological writing was thus simply a necessity in an increasingly integrated world.

The experimental elements employed in the book included its non-linear structure, which weaved back and forth in time. Though sometimes disorienting, it enabled an important contribution: acknowledging that as people change, so too do their explanations of an event, situation, cultural element or context. Small illustrated this by detailing occasions where participants had asked her to alter their statements on a previous topic, their new selves—sometimes influenced by acculturation into US world-views, sometimes by other types of changed situation, such as having gained perspective over time—had reconfigured their interpretations.

The second edition, by not updating nor amending earlier material, but simply adding a new preface and the three chapters of the final section, has accentuated this point. The transition between Part IV and this new Part V is jarring, but in a sense, as it should be. We have leapt forward roughly a decade and a half—the total span of the “voyages” of the first edition—revisiting familiar characters (including Small herself) and meeting new additions, in the process discovering how participants’ situations, but also points-of-view have changed. Significantly, Small shows that the anthropologist’s own views had also shifted and evolved since completing the original text so many years before.

The added material approximates the structure of the original: a section on the US, a section on Tonga and a section of reflection. In it, Small observes the continuing cultural change that collapsed the categories she had previously set forth, now forming a nexus of “Economy-Family-Politics-Tradition-Identity” (pp. 254-55) that operates transnationally and domestically. This is especially cogently detailed through her examination of bark cloth manufacture, sale, use and exchange. Changing substantially in form and context over time, it now stands as a symbol of tradition, identity and prestige, as well as being both a commodity and mechanism of social cohesion, depending on the context.

Here again the Tongan case is extrapolated as representative of a general global situation, and would have benefitted from some kind of engagement with anthropological work being done elsewhere to support the claim. However, a lack of robust consideration of academic literature is, of course, the price of creating popularly accessible anthropology, which *Voyages* undoubtedly is. As an anthropologically trained Tongan/European New Zealander, I can appreciate this book on multiple levels that speak to its range and reach. For the cosmopolitan citizen it opens a conversation about the complex back-stories of one’s own immigrant neighbours, and the global socio-political processes that have created the conditions for multicultural landscapes. For the student of anthropology, it gives insights into the reality of fieldwork, the murkiness of culture and the challenging process of writing ethnography. For the Tongan diasporic child it encourages reflection and analysis of the broader ethnohistory of which s/he is part, and the amorphous reality of what it means to be Tongan today. For the social scientist it is a great example of reflexivity, methodological transparency and collaboration, and also holds much of interest for anyone seeking to understand the realities of global migratory and macro-economic processes “on the ground”, and particularly how these are mediated through and within a particular culture.