



---

## REVIEWS

---

McCarthy, Conal and Mark Stocker (eds): *Colonial Gothic to Māori Renaissance: Essays in Memory of Jonathan Mane-Wheoki*. Wellington: Victoria University Press, 2017. 322 pp., biblio., illus., index. NZ\$ 80.00 (softcover).

NGARINO ELLIS

*Ngāpuhi, Ngāti Porou*  
*The University of Auckland*

*Ka tangite titi, ka tangite kaka, ka tangihoki ahau, tihei mauri ora.*

Hear the cry of the *titi*, hear the cry of the *kaka*, hear also my call, behold there is life.

Everyone remembers the moment when important people have died: Elvis (Hawai‘i), Princess Diana (Auckland waterfront) and Jonathan (packing to fly to London). It was not as if it was unexpected—I knew he was in hospice from my friend Deidre who had visited him there and given our warm hugs to him and Paul. But the fact that he was really gone now overwhelmed me. He had been part of my life as a Māori art historian for many years, initially as a hallowed figure presenting at conferences, and more recently as a dear colleague who had humbled me by inviting me to generate this new project he and Deidre were cooking up. I was very aware that Jonathan had not published a large-scale book before our project, despite a prolific and extensive bibliography to his name. *Colonial Gothic to Māori Renaissance* is a *koha* ‘gift’ by determined colleagues and friends to change this, as indeed it has.

The book was launched, appropriately, at the end of a full day of papers for a symposium just focused on the life and work of Jonathan Mane-Wheoki at Victoria University on 29 August 2017. The launch was gracious and attended by people from so many facets of his life. The book reflects these facets, and his multi-dimensional research, writing and speaking careers, drawn together by two colleagues who Jonathan highly respected, Conal McCarthy and Mark Stocker, who pitch this as a Gedenkschrift or memorial volume. There are so many great art historians working in Aotearoa New Zealand today, whose work deserves books like these that would influence not only readers and researchers here but also those overseas. Why are our art historians left out of major international art historian databases? How can we promote them and their thinking? *Colonial Gothic to Māori Renaissance* sets a new standard here.

McCarthy and Stocker have organised the book into four sections, with a Foreword by Deidre Brown (Ngāpuhi, Ngāti Kahu), an overview by McCarthy, an Afterword by Caroline Turner, and 15 chapters by friends, colleagues and ex-students. McCarthy’s chapter provides an excellent pathway into the book. He describes bumping into Jonathan in mid-2013 and the seed being sown about this book. Conal provides an overview of Jonathan’s work and life, and locates him firmly with one leg in a Victorian Christchurch, and the other in a global Māori world. He notes how Mane-

Wheoki's career shifted from away from academia towards the public manifestation of art history in museums and art galleries. He also confronts some of the niggles that peppered Jonathan's career; the "Māori come lately" argument made by some was unfair, while his support of aspects of Gordon Walter's work remains a challenging prospect to think about. McCarthy notes other failings, and in this way the book is not a mere "uff piece" and does not shy away from acknowledging these.

The first Section features two essays by Jonathan himself, each one a key angle of his practice as an art historian. They demonstrate his intimate knowledge of Victorian architecture and the church on the one hand, especially in his early career, and contemporary Māori art on the other. His attention to detail in the first essay stands out as an example of best practice, while the second essay highlights his role as a critic and commentator in relation to a field by which ultimately he was to find his way back to the *pa*. Given that Anna-Marie White identified 144 different essays and speeches (I counted), it is surprising, and just a little disappointing, that not more space in the book was given to his voice. Many of these 144 have become required reading for anyone keen to understand the nature of the contemporary arts scenes in New Zealand from the 1980s, and even earlier for Māori art.

Section Two was entitled "Victorian Art and Architectural Heritage", with five essays featured. Jonathan's colleague Ian Lochhead uses Jonathan's 1983 article on "pilgrim churches" as a starting point to examine the life and history of the church at Lyttleton, from its colonial beginnings, through the catastrophe of the Christchurch earthquakes, to Cathedral Grammar Church now replacing the fallen down structure. Another historical church study is provided in the next chapter. Here Jenny May pays homage to the solace Jonathan found inside St Michaels and All Angels Church in Christchurch, her introduction to it through his teaching and being a fellow parishioner later on. She describes the church as "Jonathan's spiritual home", reflecting the warm place that it held for him (p. 72). The third chapter shifts to look at a much larger architectural site, this time Christ's College in Christchurch. Robyn Peers, a former student of Jonathan's, charts the history since the first building of 1863, through the many renovations and extensions. What comes through clearly in this essay and May's is a deep sense of physical and spiritual loss caused by the earthquakes, and also the tenacity and sense of stoicism by so many to retain and rebuild their landscape.

From here the book shifts to focus on art history, starting with an essay wittily written by Mark Stocker on a single painting (*Idlesse* by Thomas Benjamin Kennington), prompted by Jonathan's enthusiasm for the topic when it was a blog post. Why were not more essays spurred by such moments? At times it seemed that a brief two or three lines introduced a topic when in fact the opportunity here was to engage with Jonathan's scholarship throughout the text of each chapter. Katharine Lochnan's chapter ends this section. Just as Mane-Wheoki sought to re-assert Māori art into the mainstream in this country, so too does Lochnan here make a case for Evelyn Underhill to be placed as one of the key writers and thinkers about mysticism alongside Roger Fry and Clive Bell. This parallel in methodology and indeed any mention to Jonathan is sadly avoided.

Section Three is entitled "New Zealand Art and Art History", with four chapters picking up on different areas of this field that fascinated Mane-Wheoki. Linda Tyler, an ex-student, writes about the hugely popular 1906 Exhibition held in Christchurch,

reviewing the ways in which Pakeha ‘non-Māori’ artists such as Henry Kennett Watkins were promoted to sell New Zealand as having its own distinct identity. Peter Simpson, Jonathan’s colleague at Canterbury University and the University of Auckland, uses the chapter as a way to complement Mane-Wheoki’s 2010 Hocken Lecture. Here he looks at the nature of the connection between the patron Charles Brasch and artist Colin McCahon. Simpson has drawn heavily from Brasch’s personal journals to show us their evolving relationship, and its rocky path after 1958. Such first-person insights can be powerful, and allows the reader to make their own judgements about matters.

Lara Strongman draws on her MA thesis on Fomison, supervised by Mane-Wheoki, to consider the relationship of the artist with Philip Claremont beginning with in 1969 in Christchurch. Their story is fascinating as it changed over the years and their art became important protests in themselves. Sarah Farrar’s essay rounds off this Section. As testament to Jonathan’s mentoring, she moved from student (at Canterbury) to colleague (at Te Papa)—indeed many of the writers in the book were former students and have now made significant career paths which reflects the time and energies that Mane-Wheoki put in to mentoring his students. She writes about his challenges as Head of Art and determination to keep all sides happy in the creation of *Toi Te Papa: Art of the Nation*, arguably his major contribution at Te Papa. This set the bar for later iterations, and while the narrative format was challenged by some, it was a legacy from his many years as a lecturer in Art History.

The last Section is “Māori, Pacific and Indigenous Art”. Roger Blackley writes about the Māori-commissioned portraits of Gottfried Lindauer, arguing that this Māori patronage, “offers a distinct point of difference within the art histories of the British settler colonies” (p. 200). Anna-Marie White (Te Atiawa), an ex-student, tackles the breadth of his archives, celebrating the oral nature of the majority of the documents, and the ways in which his role throughout was based on his extensive knowledge of both Māori and New Zealand art history, a background few have. Chloe Cull (Ngāi Tahu, Ngāi Te Ruahikihiki) then takes us into the workshop of Emily Karaka, based on a chapter from her MA thesis. She uses interviews with the artist to let us hear Emily’s own words, in doing so following one of the core values of *kaupapa* Māori research, where the voices of individuals have priority. She ends most appropriately with one of Emily’s poems. Karen Stevenson’s chapter uses Jonathan 2008 CIHA speech to tease out the ways in which Pacific art has found its place through the advocacy of people like Jonathan, but also institutions around the Pacific. She introduces us to three artists whose work has become globally known through their engagement with different exhibitions, at all times maintaining their role as advocates of key issues for Pacific peoples through their art. The final essay here is an interview by Martin Bryant of Huhana Smith (NgātiTukorehe, Ngāti Raukawa ki te Tonga) and Penny Allan about their collaborative design, science and *matauranga* ‘understanding’ Māori work on a Horowhenua–Kapiti coast project. While it provides a fascinating insight into some of the tricky issues of working cross-culturally, it was difficult to figure out just why the essay was chosen for the book, interesting though it was, and perhaps some stage-setting in the introduction might have been useful here.

The chapters are rounded off with an Afterword by Caroline Turner who shares some of the work that Jonathan undertook as part of the Asia Pacific Triennials

(APT). His work, particularly in relation to the 1996 APT that he co-curated with Jim Vivieaere and Margo Neale, signalled a new direction both for the APT and in many ways his own practice as an art historian. She ends with the kindest of words: “He was a fearless intellectual voyager, inspiring others to conceive of new horizons while travelling, as his courageous ancestors had done, to new worlds on an ocean with no horizon” (p. 252).

The last essay is an annotated bibliography by Anna-Marie White, a PhD student now at Victoria University after many years curating at the Suter. She meticulously lists Mane-Wheoki’s 144 works, revealing the breadth of his research, writing and speech-making, though some more critical comment on the sources would have been useful for future budding researchers. The bibliography is also not chronological, which was irritating. Based on this, a timeline of his life and work would have been really useful to understand the shifts in his practice.

The focus on Christchurch in many of the essays is a beautiful way of paying homage to Jonathan and the many years he spent around the city, not only in university classrooms, but in the church, giving public talks and supporting the city through its most difficult times by advocating for the retention of its architectural distinctiveness.

The quality of the book is unparalleled. The hard cover has boldly used an abstract portrait of Jonathan by Shannon Novak, who was mentored by Mane-Wheoki at Elam School of Fine Arts, “and was a very significant influence on his work and career” (Paul Bushnell, pers. comm., 3 July 2018). It glows with its bright pinkness, standing out on the bookshelves. Printed on thick glossy paper, and filled with stunning colour images throughout, the attention to detail is clear from the first page. It certainly sets a new standard for publishing.

As an architecture aficionado it is only right that we think of Jonathan Mane-Wheoki’s writings as a *whare* ‘house’: all his many writings provide the foundation stones, the essays in *Colonial Gothic to Māori Renaissance* can be conceived of as *poupou* “supports”, as they build layers onto Jonathan Mane-Wheoki’s own work—so what is built next? Perhaps his project *Toi Te Mana* might be able to add something here. While Jonathan may no longer be with us, his *whakairo* ‘thoughts’ and his *moemoea* ‘dreams’ continue on as Deidre Brown and I complete the first draft. In *Toi Te Mana* we will be including his own writing, some of which he left us just for the project, and others sections taken from those 144 resources. These have become *taonga tukuiho* ‘heirlooms’ for us, as they will for others.

Ultimately, Conal McCarthy and Mark Stocker must be applauded for their tenacity in gathering and editing all the material in *Colonial Gothic to Māori Renaissance: Essays in Memory of Jonathan Mane-Wheoki*. It truly is a symbol of the *aroha* ‘love’ that they had for Jonathan, as he had for them. *Moe mai, e Jonathan*.

*Kia torotouao, me temarakumara, Awhimaioi aka, iterawakore, kia puta maitou whanau, tipuake, heiputipupuawai, moteaowhanui*

May your world flourish, like a garden of kumara, and your vines reach out to, those in need, may your family grow, and emerge, like flowers blossoming, over the wide world.

Arapera Blank, *Kitetahitangata kai-ngakau. To a Sensitive Person*, from her book *For Someone I Love*.