



# JPS

The Journal  
of the  
Polynesian Society

VOLUME 130 No.3 SEPTEMBER 2021

THE POLYNESIAN SOCIETY  
THE UNIVERSITY OF AUCKLAND  
NEW ZEALAND

---

## REVIEWS

---

ORANGE, Claudia: *The Treaty of Waitangi/Te Tiriti o Waitangi: An Illustrated History*. Wellington: Bridget Williams Books, 2021. 488 pp., biblio., illus., index. NZ\$49.99 (softcover).

NICHOLAS JONES  
*University of Auckland*

Claudia Orange's *The Treaty of Waitangi/Te Tiriti o Waitangi: An Illustrated History* is an eloquently written social history that brings to light the history of the Treaty of Waitangi and its impact on Aotearoa New Zealand's development as a nation. This second illustrated version builds upon Orange's earlier editions (*The Treaty of Waitangi* first appeared in 1987) to highlight the continued importance of the Treaty in Aotearoa's history and society. Chronologically ordered, the reader is taken through the historical events that led to the forming and signing of the Treaty and the impact of the Treaty on both Pākehā 'New Zealand European' and Māori communities up to 2020. Written in an accessible manner, this digestible text is suitable for a wide range of reading levels and will be of interest to academics and non-academics alike.

Unlike many texts that discuss the Treaty, *The Treaty of Waitangi/Te Tiriti o Waitangi: An Illustrated History* does not fall into the pitfall of confining the history of the Treaty to the immediate pre-signing circumstances and post-signing history. Rather, Orange draws from and intertwines pre-Treaty historical events to explain the basis for subsequent colonial justification of British sovereignty over the whole of Aotearoa. As she notes, William Hobson, while believing that the *rangatira* 'chiefs' of the North Island ceded sovereignty by signing the Treaty, felt himself justified in claiming British sovereignty over the South Island and Stewart Island as well, on the assumption that James Cook had "discovered" these islands (p. 50). The interweaving of historical events and colonial ideologies that ultimately came to shape the actualisation, implementation and effect of the Treaty is consistently upheld throughout the book and presents one of its greatest strengths.

Orange also emphasises the pivotal role *wāhine* 'women' played in Treaty processes, both as signatories, such as Rangitopeora, and in progressing Māori Treaty rights and interests, such as Whina Cooper and Tariana Turia. This is further underscored by the well-balanced incorporation of images of women and men throughout the book. Indeed, images have been well employed with captions adding valuable social detail and further historical contextualisation beyond the main body of text. Additionally, unlike Orange's previous editions, which featured monochrome images, this third edition makes use of a vast array of colour images, bringing history to life.

Although Orange attempts to present a balanced overall analysis of the history of the Treaty, opportunities have been missed to frame understandings and conceptualisations from a *te ao Māori* 'Māori worldview' perspective. While clearly

distinguishing between the Treaty of Waitangi and Te Tiriti o Waitangi, there is a tendency to default to English terminology after introducing comparative te reo Māori ‘Maori language’ translations in other instances. Moreover, nuanced understanding of the essential role of *whenua* ‘land’ and *moana* ‘sea’ as a base from which Māori draw a sense of *tūrangawaewae* ‘a place to stand, a sense of identity’ was also missed. This is particularly evident in chapter three, “A Matter of Mana—1840 to 1870”, in which Māori retention of *whenua* is framed as being important simply because of their “associated resources” (p. 69).

Orange’s revised chapter nine, “New Century, New Challenges—2000 to 2008”, and newly included chapter ten, “National Years—2008 to 2017”, discuss some of the most prominent issues facing the Treaty settlement process. This is especially evident in chapter nine’s new subsection, “Iwi Criticisms of the Settlement Process”, which provides invaluable commentary on how the settlement process is problematic for Māori. As Orange explains, many *hapū* ‘subtribes’ believe the Crown is unable to meet “the aspirations of all the groups involved in any claim” (p. 294) due to their preference to deal with “large natural groupings” (p. 294) such as *iwi* ‘tribal’ bodies. Building on this, chapter ten underscores the flaws in rushing Treaty settlement negotiation processes. Orange comments upon the incredible demand timeframes put on *iwi* who do not have access to the same funding or support networks as the Crown (p.350). Due to the immense number of *hapū* that constitute some *iwi* and some *hapū* opposition to some Crown-recognised mandates, consensus and resolution take a significant amount of time. Consequently, as Orange stresses, fast-paced settlement negotiations like those attempted with Ngā Puhī “did not produce effective outcomes” (p. 353).

A particularly enjoyable new addition, chapter eleven, “Building New Bridges”, underscores the vital role of the public in building fruitful Māori–Crown relationships and hints at how Treaty settlements and meaningful partnership will benefit Aotearoa. This benefit includes *iwi* regional development (p. 367). To achieve this, emphasis has been placed on the need for developing Aotearoa’s national consciousness and public attitude in understanding “the extent of change” (p. 368) for both signatory partners. Orange maintains that this development is crucial for a shift in mindset and attitudes of both politicians and the public in order to “grasp the revolutionary changes that are now taking place—and for the country to build on them” (p. 370). Orange highlights many endeavours that have sought to address this. These include the growing use of te reo Māori, restoration of te reo place names, and the 2019 New Zealand History Teachers’ Association petition to centre Aotearoa’s history in the school curriculum by 2022 (pp. 371–72). This civic development is postulated to negate rash decisions that come to negatively affect this relationship (p. 370).

While overall being well-balanced in drawing upon both Māori and Pākehā written sources, integrating more community voices would have been welcome. Interview material used has largely centred on the voices of prominent individuals involved in Treaty negotiations, and those in governmental positions. These voices include those of Christopher Finlayson, Sir Michael Cullen, Dr Briar Gordon, and Kiritapu Allen, resulting in the dominance of government-centric voices. Integrating community voices, such as those of *iwi* and *hapū* leaders, would bring to light nuanced understandings of contested history—such as the circumstances



surrounding the execution of Maketū (p. 63). Furthermore, such community voices would contribute towards a more vivid depiction of the impact of Treaty policies on Māori communities at the local level.

Notwithstanding, this omission does not detract from the overall relevance of *The Treaty of Waitangi/Te Tiriti o Waitangi: An Illustrated History*. This new edition is an important contribution to the scholarship on Aotearoa's history. It provides a comprehensive foundation in understanding the Treaty and its impact in both historic and contemporary contexts. In light of ongoing national conversations, this well-researched, historically interwoven narrative is essential reading for anyone interested in Aotearoa's history and is a valuable addition to every New Zealander's bookshelf.

<https://doi.org/10.15286/jps.130.3.267-269>

DONALDSON, Emily C.: *Working with the Ancestors: Mana and Place in the Marquesas Islands*. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2019. 280 pp., biblio., illus., maps, notes. US\$30.00 (softcover).

CHRISTOPHE SAND

*French National Research Institute for Sustainable Development (IRD-Noumea),  
New Caledonia*

“One of my primary research goals was to go into the woods as frequently, and with as many different people, as possible in order to understand how Marquesans view, value, and use their heritage and the land” (p. xvii). Emily C. Donaldson's book puts forward a deep dive into the complexities of indigenous approaches to “heritage” in Pacific Island communities, by presenting a detailed study on the Marquesas Islands. The author has a two-decade-long relationship with the archipelago and is fluent in both Marquesan and French. This allowed her, although her primary training is in archaeology, to carry out her study with a defined anthropological scope, by interviewing about 350 people on the six inhabited islands. The small island of Tahuata was the main focus of her endeavour. The whole work is, evidently, organised around the question “What does heritage mean to you?” (p. xviii)—a challenging topic for the Pacific where the term “heritage” is multifaceted, encompassing culture and nature, past and present, the visible and the invisible. The Marquesas region, with its distinctive characteristics, has been the subject of a campaign for over three decades for it to be recognised as a World Heritage Site, compelling the local communities to become familiar with UNESCO's approach to historic places. The book is divided into six chapters, following a foreword, a long preface and an introduction. After the conclusion, a set of four appendices, a glossary, a large set of notes and a reference list round out the book.

The introduction sets the scene by highlighting the apparent conflict between an indigenous approach to the land, seen as a living landscape embodying the ancestors' power or *mana*, and a more Western and academic approach, which the author defines as a form of colonial territorialisation. Donaldson makes clear from the start how the “UNESCO project” is used by the Islanders for what she calls “tacit resistance

as they move to advance certain political, economic, and cultural interests through Marquesan heritage” (p. 11). To understand how these different topics interrelate, the second half of the introduction presents a concise history of the archipelago, the devastating consequences of massive depopulation in the nineteenth century and the cultural revitalisation efforts of recent decades (see also Appendix B).

Chapter One introduces the archipelago, in both geographical and cultural terms, underlining the importance of invisible and spiritual elements in approaching Marquesan landscapes. Perceptions of *tapu* ‘sacred’ and *mana* ‘power, prestige, authority’ in relation to former *paepae* ‘stone platforms’ (typically domestic), *me‘ae* ‘sacred site, temple’ or other built structures visible in the bush appear from the study to be negotiated mainly through an individual approach, linked to family connections to places. The complexities of land tenure are discussed in Chapter Two, showing the profound impact of changes to the land rights of families made under missionary and colonial rule. Depopulation broke the natural transmission of knowledge about boundaries and reshaped land divisions, Christian superstition fostered fear around traditional *tapu*, and departures to Tahiti of family members led to multiple joint ownerships of property, putting land use into a permanent state of stress.

Chapter Three, “Marquesan Engagements with Place and the Past”, is certainly one of the most enlightening parts of the book. It proposes a realistic and honest perspective of the present approach to the invisible in Marquesan communities. Far from some of the idealised anthropological and archaeological studies that still appear in the literature, the author presents the disruption of knowledge about the past and the landscape experienced over the last two centuries by the ancestors of the present-day Islanders. This led to profound trauma for some of the elders, while others internalised the missionary idea that the precolonial past was a brutal and chaotic “dark age”. More importantly, the chapter stresses how Islanders have preserved the link with the invisible through different spiritual approaches. This was achieved by reconceptualising the fearsome elements of invisible power and the potency of specific sites in mediating between traditional and Christian beliefs. Individual approaches to *mana* and *tapu* produce a diversity of behaviours, with some families completely avoiding working near old historic sites, others paying respect to the sites but still planting on them, and still others of the opinion that the ruins must be physically destroyed.

Chapter Four presents a study of the economic significance of the land for the livelihoods of the Marquesans. The island economy is composed of subsistence activities (informal market) and cash production (formal market), and while the archipelago is isolated from the main economic centre, Tahiti, modernity is slowly changing the paradigm, with parents pushing their children to remain in school for as long as possible. This leads to a break in the connection with the land, fostering a drop in the copra and planting economy and the rise of new uses of family property for cash, one focus being on cultural tourism. This topic is discussed in Chapter Five, the author choosing to build her analysis around issues related to the UNESCO nomination. Her summary highlights the mistrust expressed by most of the Islanders interviewed towards the overall World Heritage nomination project. This mistrust is related to questions of identity and resistance to global heritage policies and objectives, based especially on a feeling of potential dispossession of landownership and on the local desire to claim the Marquesas’ cultural distinctiveness from Tahiti.

The overly long process of finalising the UNESCO file has also led over the last decade to even the most enthusiastic Marquesans doubting a positive outcome.

The final chapter aims to illustrate the difficulty of preserving the sustainability of heritage projects and the imbalance between cultural revival and pride and everyday constraints in site maintenance. The author discusses, through a series of examples, the need to accept that “[i]ndigenizing the concepts of sustainability and heritage preservation in the Marquesas might also require an acceptance of intentional loss and the need to forget certain sites in order to move forward” (p. 164). The short conclusion draws from the numerous interviews a desire to return to the sacredness of the land for Marquesans and the need to include in preservation efforts not only the material remains of heritage places but also the invisible and the specific trauma that colonial history has wrought upon present-day Islanders.

*Working with the Ancestors* is a pleasant book to read, full of lively anecdotes and excerpts of interviews, bringing humanity to the topic and avoiding academic jargon. The photographic illustrations, while not numerous, are informative, as are the five diagrams that summarise key elements in graphic form. The author analyses the topic of heritage as it is understood, expressed and lived by the Marquesan Islanders, with its local characteristics and ambiguities. This was probably one of the project’s most difficult challenges, as she makes it explicit from the start that her position as an archaeologist prompted people in the community to present a positive view on heritage. Being fluent in both Marquesan and French certainly helped Donaldson avoid agreeable answers in the interviews and capture the subtle differences in personal approach between individuals. By systematically reminding the reader of the context of the pre-contact and colonial history witnessed by the Islanders, the author disentangles the complexities of the archipelago’s case. Endemic violence and wars, depopulation, harsh Christianisation, the recent exodus of family members, resistance against Tahitian cultural homogenisation, schooling and the shift to the cash economy as well as the invisible but ever-present forces of mana, tapu and ancestors’ spirits all influence the Islanders’ present-day perception of and relation to historic places. The book also makes clear that generational differences are at play, older people approaching the paepae sites more warily than do younger activists. On a global scale, the study highlights a number of themes that arise in the UNESCO World Heritage approach to indigenous understandings of place in an increasing number of regions across the globe. It especially shows how, in a colonial setting where administration, Tahitian politics and the expertise of outsiders are seen as invasive policies, “heritage” is used by local communities as a tool for pursuing other objectives.

Nearly 25 years after it was initiated, the UNESCO file for the Marquesas is yet to be finalised. This book offers a unique analysis of the project’s complexities and provides some keys to moving forward in the right direction. It is an important read for all those working on heritage matters in the Pacific. In addition to professionals, the audience of French Polynesian Islanders will be interested in the outcomes of Donaldson’s work, and the author should consider a translation of this study into French—the only colonial language understood both by the Marquesans and by the other Polynesians in Tahiti, the Tuamotus and the other French Polynesian archipelagos.

