

JPS

VOLUME 131 No.1 MARCH 2022

THE POLYNESIAN SOCIETY
THE UNIVERSITY OF AUCKLAND
NEW ZEALAND

The Journal
of the
Polynesian Society



REVIEWS

BALLANTYNE, Tony, Lachy Paterson and Angela Wanhalla (eds): *Indigenous Textual Cultures: Reading and Writing in the Age of Global Empire*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2020. 368 pp., biblio., illus., index, notes. US\$28.95 (softcover).

FELICITY BARNES
University of Auckland

The cover of this fine collection of essays sets the book's agenda. Leaves of a book recounting the "extermination of Tasmanian Aborigines" (p. 7) are impaled by tea tree spears, in an image taken of Julie Gough's work, *Some Words for Change* (2008). Gough's point—and the point of the collection—is clear. In colonial settings, words have a particular power, and those texts which occlude indigeneity, or assume its failure to adapt, should be resisted. Instead, by paying attention to indigenous engagement with textual cultures richer stories can be told that capture "indigenous aspirations, experiences, and arguments articulated in the face of the (literally) unsettling claims of colonial authority" (p. 8).

Something of that richness is revealed in a series of chapters that range from New Zealand and Australia to Africa, and cross the Pacific to North America. Yet the collection goes beyond revealing possibilities to mounting a notably coherent set of arguments about the nature of, and research approaches to, indigenous textual cultures. As we might expect, all the contributors press against the marginalisation of indigenous voices. However, two of the field's shibboleths are also challenged: the link between literacy and "civilisation", and the idea that oral and literate cultures are fundamentally opposed, ideas associated with Jack Goody and Walter Ong in particular. The stakes are laid out clearly in Tony Ballantyne and Lachy Paterson's well-judged introduction, but the issues thread themselves through the book. Some examples illustrate the range and depth of this engagement. Laura Rademaker undermines the assumed connection between literacy and civilisation by charting the rejection of literacy by the Anindilyakwa people of Australia's Groote Eylandt when it failed to offer them the promised benefits of citizenship, while Emma Hunter complicates the link between colonialism and literacy by using the rise and spread of Swahili as a reminder of the "impossibility" of generalising about textual cultures in colonial settings (p. 177). Various authors chart the intricate entanglement between orality and textuality. Here the Pacific features strongly, with chapters by Michael Reilly on Mangaia and Bruno Saura on family manuscripts from the Society and Austral Islands. The effects of the orality/literacy divide

also play out in chapters concerned with the place of indigeneous textuality in archives. Alban Bensa and Adrian Muckle use archival sources of New Caledonia's 1917 war to make the case that despite being seen conventionally as an "oral" culture, a Kanak writing and literacy tradition has been hiding in plain sight. Similarly, Noelani Arista explores the marginalisation of Hawaiian-language archival sources, despite their abundance. Such archival marginalisation has consequences, as Arini Loader reveals in her contribution tracing the telling and retelling of the life of Māori leader Te Rauparaha (Ngāti Toa Rangatira, Ngāti Raukawa). In an acute case of colonial archival capture, then effacement, Te Rauparaha's story was first penned by his son, Tāmihana Te Rauparaha. However, whilst a stream of authors borrowed freely and loosely from his text to collectively create the received settler version of his life, the original remained trapped, unacknowledged and out of popular consciousness, in an archive.

As these examples suggest, in keeping with the book's intention to challenge existing notions of indigenous textuality, a very wide range of source materials is considered, from personal journals kept during the eighteenth century by Mohegan Presbyterian minister Samson Occom to New Guinea's pidgin-language newspapers of the 1960s. In most chapters, attention is focussed on the discursive properties of these diverse texts. Yet there may be more to consider. A few contributors extend their analyses beyond the text: by considering the epitextual issue of copyright, Isabel Hofmeyr links writing with expression of indigenous citizenship. Others situate their analysis in the materiality of reading and writing cultures. Such a manoeuvre not only offers further insights into indigenous practices, but continues to push the debate away from the familiar orality/literacy divide towards a set of quite different concerns, contextualised with quite different scholarship. Keith Thor Carlson's chapter, on Canada's Salish people in the nineteenth century, takes a material turn. Rather than relitigating the orality debate, he draws on Harold Innis's argument—made more than 70 years ago in *Empire and Communications*—that some empires emphasised time in their communication systems, using media like stone or clay, whilst others privileged space, extending their administrative networks through the use of lightweight materials like papyrus. Using this idea—that the material matters—he then analyses the role media played in negotiating "the dynamic interplay of colonialism and modernity" in this colonial setting (p. 106). Using this framework, the tension is not simply between spoken and written words, but between time and space, or the meanings generated by Salish petroglyphs and carved longhouses and those set in motion by a European explorer's portable writing desk. In this case, it is not just that orality and literacy are not so easily disaggregated, but that textuality is also deeply entangled with materiality.

Analyses like this (and in the final chapter, which explores a variety of North American Indian modes of communication) suggest intriguing new research possibilities. They might even shed light on those in New Guinea who, as Evelyn Ellerman showed, preferred to smoke, rather than read, their newspapers. More immediately, it might inspire a further collection that would continue to build on the important scholarship on display in *Indigenous Textual Cultures*, which is essential reading for researchers in the field.

<https://doi.org/10.15286/jps.131.1.93-95>

NGATA, Wayne, Arapata Hakiwai, Anne Salmond, Conal McCarthy, Amiria Salmond, Monty Soutar, James Schuster, Billie Lythberg, John Niko Maihi, Sandra Kahu Nepia, Te Wheturere Poope Grey, Te Aroha McDonnell and Natalie Robertson: *Hei Taonga mā ngā Uri Whakatipu | Treasures for the Rising Generation: The Dominion Museum Ethnological Expeditions, 1919–1923*. Wellington: Te Papa Press, 2021. 368 pp., appendices, biblio., glossary, index, notes, photos. NZ\$75.00 (hardcover).

ROWAN LIGHT

University of Auckland

Auckland War Memorial Museum

There is a version of Aotearoa New Zealand histories that emphasises a story of colonisers and colonised. *Hei Taonga mā ngā Uri Whakatipu | Treasures for the Rising Generation* offers something far more nuanced, richer and important. The book explores four expeditions undertaken by Dominion Museum anthropologists to different parts of Te Ika-a-Māui (the North Island of New Zealand) into the 1920s—the Gisborne Hui Aroha in 1919, Rotorua in 1920, Whanganui River in 1921 and Tairāwhiti East Coast in 1923. These expeditions provided crucial ethnological research for the Dominion Museum (today Museum of New Zealand Te Papa Tongarewa) and included Pākehā ‘New Zealand European’ researchers such as Elsdon Best, Johannes Andersen and James McDonald whose intention was one of gathering the remnants of Māori culture “scattered by the winds of change” (p. 115) caused by colonial conflict, land loss and societal disruption.

Hei Taonga mā ngā Uri Whakatipu reframes the expeditions around key Māori leaders (and their communities) who appear not as mere participants but as instigators. Apirana Ngata and Te Rangihiroa (Sir Peter Buck) are central here. Their purpose was not salvage but revitalisation, initiating and directing the expeditions to collect *taonga* ‘traditional treasures’—as various as *waiata* ‘songs’, games, customary rites and material culture, in notes, film, and phonographic and photographic recordings—for future generations. In this way, the expeditions were marked by interactions that were collaborative,